Where is the Scholarship in Engaged Scholarship?

Part I

Lorilee R. Sandmann, Ph.D.
University of New Hampshire
Engaged Scholars Academy

February 12, 2010
“Engagement implies strenuous, thoughtful, argumentative interaction with the non-university world in at least four spheres: setting universities’ aims, purposes, and priorities; relating teaching and learning to the wider world; the back-and-forth dialogue between researchers and practitioners; and taking on wider responsibilities as neighbors and citizens.”

Association of Commonwealth Universities
“American colleges and universities are one of the greatest hopes for intellectual and civic progress in this country. I am convinced that for this hope to be fulfilled, the academy must become a more vigorous partner in the search for answers to our most pressing social, civic, economic and moral problems, and must reaffirm its historic commitment to what I call the scholarship of engagement.”


© L.R. Sandmann, 2010
“The experience of engagement will become the pathway to a fresh interpretation of the 21st century. This conception rests on the rethinking of the core of the academy, namely, the nature of scholarship itself.”

Judith Ramaley (2005)
“If outreach and engagement didn’t exist, presidents would invent it.”

“Outreach and engagement is about serving a mission and making money.”

- Mission—achieving humanity, improving conditions, strengthening democracy, producing economy prosperity
- Money—increase demand/new sources of revenue

Ronald Cervero (2007)
The Case and Context for Engagement

- Historical/Social Underpinnings for Engagement
- Intellectual and Conceptual Underpinning for Engaged Scholarship

© L.R. Sandmann, 2010
The Civic Purpose of Higher Education

"Unless education has some frame of reference it is bound to be aimless, lacking a unified objective. The necessity for a frame of reference must be admitted. There exists in this country such a unified frame. It is called democracy."

John Dewey (1937)
Why Now?

- **External Pressures**
  - Accountability to achieve a broad set of social & economic purposes
  - Education of social capital for a democratic citizenry
  - Growing interdependent, global, transnational consciousness
  - Emergence of diversity as an educational value and catalyst
  - Workplace pressures to know how to work collaboratively and solve problems in teams

- **The New Academy**
  - Expanding ways of knowing
  - Broadening definitions of scholarship and what is rewarded
  - Development in the disciplines and creation of new (problem-centered) interdisciplinary fields
  - Millennial faculty

© L.R. Sandmann, 2010
Focus, Emphasis, Intent

Giles (2008)

- Civic Education
- Civic Engagement
- Community Engagement
- Community-based Learning
- Community Service
- Engaged Scholarship
- Experiential Learning
- Extension
- Outreach
- Participatory Action Research
- Partnerships
- Professional Service
- Public Scholar(ship)
- Public Service
- Scholarship of Engagement
- Scholarship on Engagement
- Service
- Service Learning
- Voluntary Service
- ...Others?

© L.R. Sandmann, 2010
Engagement Umbrella

- Punctuations—Evolved into a multifaceted field

- Engagement Defined
- Engagement as Teaching and Research
- Engagement as a Scholarly Expression
- Engagement Institutionalized and Socialized

Sandmann (2008)

© L.R. Sandmann, 2010
Engagement Defined

- Substantiating the need for higher education’s engagement with the communities
- Defining characteristics, values, principles
- Emphasizing bidirectional interactions, reciprocity, and mutual respect to expand the traditional concept of outreach, public service

© L.R. Sandmann, 2010
Kellogg Commission...

7 Part Test--
- Responsiveness
- Respect for partners
- Academic Neutrality
- Accessibility
- Integration
- Coordination
- Resource Partnerships
Community Engagement describes the collaboration between higher education institutions and their larger communities (local, regional/state, national, global) for the mutually beneficial exchange of knowledge and resources in a context of partnership and reciprocity.

Carnegie Foundation for the Advancement of Teaching, 2006
New Elective Engagement Classification—
195 institutions selected for classification

- Institutional Identity
- Institutional Commitment
  - Curricular Engagement
  - Outreach and Partnerships

http://www.carnegiefoundation.org/Classification/index.htm

© L.R. Sandmann, 2010
Accreditation Commissions...

The Higher Learning Commission
Serving the common good by assuring and advancing the quality of higher learning.

Criterion Five: Engagement and Service
As called for by its mission, the organization identifies its constituencies and serves them in ways both value.
University engagement is direct, two-way interaction with external constituencies through the development, exchange, and application of knowledge, information, and expertise for mutual benefit. Engagement activities may be initiated by community partners or by University faculty, staff, or students.

Service is an initiative generated by the institution or institutional representatives in which knowledge, information, and expertise is provided for the benefit of external constituencies. Service initiatives may be generated in response to requests from an external constituent, but do not imply a mutually beneficial exchange.

University of Southern Indiana, 2005

© L.R. Sandmann, 2010
## A Typology of Institutional Responses to the Scholarship of Engagement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Primary Educational Mission</th>
<th>Definition of Engagement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Liberal arts college</td>
<td>Citizenship training for democracy Character formation</td>
<td>Engaging with ideas of value&lt;br&gt;Training citizens for public life</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research university</td>
<td>Expanding the knowledge base</td>
<td>Applying knowledge to solve social problems and issues</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professional school</td>
<td>Teaching applied, concrete skills</td>
<td>Training professionals to perform needed social functions&lt;br&gt;Clinical training</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Community college     | Providing access to nontraditional populations                   | Access to ed. opport.<br>Access to employ. opport.                                     | **Ward (2003)**
Engagement as Teaching and Research

- Uncoupled from service, public service, outreach in many forms
- Engagement through partnerships
  - Manifested through instruction (e.g. service learning) and research (applied research, participatory action research, community-based research)
- Describing service-learning and university-community partnership cases
- Identifying benefits for both students and communities
- Scholarship of application

© L.R. Sandmann, 2010
“Selfishly, I think Penn students have so much to learn from engagement...they have a lot to learn about the process of the creation of knowledge in a democratic society...knowledge is made in the world, in the end, and for the world, as much in art as it is in science. Universities engage multiple partners in the production of knowledge, and we cannot erect barriers between universities and communities in that process. We are, in short, all in this together.”

Rebecca Bushnell, Dean of the School of Arts and Sciences

© L.R. Sandmann, 2010
Community Partners

© L.R. Sandmann, 2010
Engagement As a Scholarly Expression

- Two tracks: institutional civic engagement & SOE
- Evolving a distinctive scholarly expression
- Two grounding principles
  - Mutual benefits
  - Reciprocal partnerships and integration of teaching, research, and service
- Scholarly engagement, community engaged scholarship, public scholarship
  - Principles of engagement & standards of scholarship

© L.R. Sandmann, 2010
# Five Practices of Engaged Scholarship

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Practice</th>
<th>Theory</th>
<th>Problems Addressed</th>
<th>Methods</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Public scholarship</td>
<td>Deliberative</td>
<td>Complex “public” problems requiring deliberation</td>
<td>Face to face, open forums</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participatory research</td>
<td>Participatory democracy</td>
<td>Inclusion of specific groups</td>
<td>Face to face collaboration with specific publics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community partnership</td>
<td>Social democracy</td>
<td>Social change, structural transformation</td>
<td>Collaboration with inter-mediary groups</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public information networks</td>
<td>Democracy broadly understood</td>
<td>Problems of networking, communication</td>
<td>Databases of public resources</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Civic literacy scholarship</td>
<td>Democracy broadly understood</td>
<td>Enhancing public discourse</td>
<td>Communication with general public</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Scholarly Engagement is the creation, integration, application and transmission of knowledge for the benefits of external audiences and the University and occurs in all areas of the University Mission: research, teaching and service. The quality and value of Scholarly Engagement is determined by academic peers and community partners.

UMass Faculty Senate Outreach Council (2006)
The foundation of academic public health practice in schools of public health is the traditional academic paradigm of research, teaching, and service—infused and motivated by scholarship that includes discovery, synthesis, integration, and application. (p. 2)

ASPH (1999)

Demonstrating Excellence in Academic Public Health Practice

© L.R. Sandmann, 2010
Actualizing *the scholarship of engagement* under the institutional cultures emphasizing traditional scholarship

- Exploring new reward and administrative structures
- Developing an institutional framework identifying and supporting engagement as a scholarly function

© L.R. Sandmann, 2010
Engaged Scholarship via Disciplines

- Public Sociology (Burawoy, 2004, 2005)
- Public Scholarship (Peters, 2005)
- Community Engaged Scholarship in Health Professions (CCPH, 2005)
- Engaged Scholarship (Van de Ven, 2007)
- Others--transdisciplinary, translational… CA, UK, Australia

© L.R. Sandmann, 2010
Pathways to the Scholarship of Engagement

Improved Teaching and Learning
Pedagogical Pathway

The Civic Mission of Higher Education
Mission Pathway

The New Production of Knowledge
Epistemological Pathway

Connecting to the Community
Partnership Pathway

John Saltmarsh, Ph.D.
NERCHE, UMass- Boston

© L.R. Sandmann, 2010
The Landscape

- Socialization/Capacity Building
  - Curricula—emerging scholars, faculty, executive leadership
- Confederation of Interests...HENCE
- Institutional Type—Research
- International
- Topical—Assessment, Measurement, etc.
- Linkage with Development
- Scholarship about SOE

© L.R. Sandmann, 2010
Issues with Institutionalization of Engaged Scholarship

- Disorganizes an institution organized around the disciplines
- Warrants interdisciplinary when there are not structures
- Warrants teamwork when reward structures focus on individuals
- Requires institutional adaptation
- Expects democratic processes and lessons from a non-democratic institution

© L.R. Sandmann, 2010
What do you mean by engagement and engaged scholarship?

What has led you toward being an engaged scholar?
- Values & Principles
- Context
- Practices

What do you see as facilitators, barriers toward engaged scholarship (in general, and particularly for you)?
Where is the Scholarship in Engaged Scholarship?

Part II
AGENDA...

- Definitions—Engagement, Scholarship, Engaged Scholarship
- Building and Evaluating Engaged Scholarship
  - Standards
  - Documentation
- Engaged Scholar Competencies

© L.R. Sandmann, 2010
“...scholarship is a choice of how to live as well as a choice of a career.”

C. Wright Mills
The Sociological Imagination,
1959
Not Everything is...

- Engagement
- Effective Outreach & Engagement
- Engaged Scholarship
  - what is quality
  - what is worth rewarding
  - how is it assessed
- Scholarship about Engaged Scholarship

© L.R. Sandmann, 2010
Definitional Confusion

© L.R. Sandmann, 2010
Service Outreach Engagement

Degree of academic/intellectual influence and influence of partners

© L.R. Sandmann, 2010
Principles of Engagement + Standards of Scholarship =

Engaged Scholarship

© L.R. Sandmann, 2010
Engaged Scholarship at UNH is...

“a mutually beneficial collaboration between the University of New Hampshire (New Hampshire’s land, sea and space grant institution) and community partners for the purpose of generating and applying relevant knowledge to directly benefit the public.”

UNH NEASC Self Study, 2002

© L.R. Sandmann, 2010
Values/Norms of Engaged Scholarship

- Place-Related
- Interactive—Respectful/Collaborative
- Mutually Beneficial
- Integrated
- Dedication to Learning—emphasis on values of community, responsibility, stewardship & mutual concern

© L.R. Sandmann, 2010
What is Engaged Scholarship?

- Scholarship – What
- Engaged Scholarship – How
- For the Common, Public Good – Toward What End

© L.R. Sandmann, 2010
What is Scholarship?

Scholarship is original intellectual work which is communicated and the significance is validated by peers. Scholarship may emerge from teaching, research or other responsibilities. Scholarship may take the many forms including, but not limited to: research contributing to a body of knowledge, development of new technology, materials, or methods; integration of knowledge or technology leading to new interpretations or applications; creation and interpretation in the arts.

Oregon State University (1999)

© L.R. Sandmann, 2010
# Scholarship Compared

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Traditional</th>
<th>Engaged Scholarship</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>breaks new ground in the discipline</td>
<td>breaks new ground in the discipline and has direct application to broader public issues</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>answers significant questions in the discipline</td>
<td>answers significant questions in the discipline which have relevance to public or community issues</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>is reviewed and validated by qualified peers in the discipline</td>
<td>is reviewed and validated by qualified peers in the discipline and members of the community</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

© L.R. Sandmann, 2010
New Approaches to Knowledge Production and Research

- Mode I – traditional, pure, disciplinary, homogeneous, expert-led, hierarchical, peer reviewed, university-based

- Mode II – applied, problem-centered, transdisciplinary social and economic contexts, heterogeneous, hybrid, demand-driven, entrepreneurial, network-embedded, not necessarily led by universities

Gibbons, et al. (1994)
Quadrant Model of Scientific Research

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Quest for fundamental understanding?</th>
<th>Consideration of use?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pure basic research (Bohr)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Use-inspired research (Pasteur)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pure applied research (Edison)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Stokes, D. (1997). *Pasteur’s Quadrant*  
© L.R. Sandmann, 2010
Engaged Scholarship

- Engaged Pedagogy
  - contextual, social
  - local, problem-based collaborative practice
- Community-based Research
  - local and cosmopolitan knowledge
- Collaborative Practice
  - Noah Principle “No more prizes for predicting rain. Prizes only for building the arks.”

© L.R. Sandmann, 2010
Engaged Scholarship

- Scholarship—practices that cut across the categories of academic scholarship (discovery, teaching, application & integration) +
- Engagement—reciprocal, collaborative relationships with partners external to the university. Boyer (1996)

- Scholarly engagement consists of
  - Research, teaching, integration and application scholarship that

© L.R. Sandmann, 2010
Engaged Scholarship

- Scholarly boundary crossing

- Scholarship in engagement
  - Scholarly engagement in teaching
  - Scholarly engagement in research
  - Scholarly engagement in service
  - Scholarship guided by an engagement ethos—connect in coherent, thematic, scholarly ways

© L.R. Sandmann, 2010
Teaching, learning and research activities are strengthened through collaborative knowledge-exchange relationships.
Figure 1 | Community-Engaged Teaching, Research, and Service

Community-based participatory research
Practice-based research

Research

Teaching

Community-based learning
Practice-based learning
Service-learning

Community-Engaged

Service

Community service
Academic public health practice
Clinical service
Community-oriented primary care

Commission on Com.-Engaged Scholarship for the Health Prof., CCPH (2005)

© L.R. Sandmann, 2010
Engaged Scholarship

Term that captures scholarship in the multiple aspects of teaching, research, and/or service. This type of scholarship engages faculty in academically relevant work that simultaneously fulfills the campus mission and goals as well as community needs. Engagement is a scholarly agenda that incorporates communities’ issues and which can be within or integrative across teaching research and service.

National Review Board for the Scholarship of Engagement (2001)

© L.R. Sandmann, 2010
Architecture of Engaged Scholarship:
Same Questions, Different Answers

- Purpose
- Questions
- Research Design
- Data Analysis
- Dissemination

© L.R. Sandmann, 2010
Engaged Scholarship

- Community-based research
- Participatory Action research
- Transdisciplinary research
- Public Issue research
- Collaborative, networked research
- Translational research

© L.R. Sandmann, 2010
Engaged Scholarship

- Collaborative and participatory
- Draws on many sources of distributed knowledge; based on partnerships
- Shaped by multiple perspectives and expectations
- Deals with difficult, evolving questions
- Long term in both effort and impact
- Requires diverse strategies and approaches; crosses disciplinary lines

© L.R. Sandmann, 2010
Means faculty (campus or community-based) as scholars taking on problems through disciplinary means, fulfilling campus missions, and incorporating teaching, research, and service in a context of partnership and reciprocity.
Beyond Application & Service

- Assumes established epistemology where knowledge is generated by faculty members in the university and then applied in external contexts.

- Collaborative -- learning and instruction are multidirectional and expertise is shared.

- Reconceptualizes faculty involvement in community-based work.

- Effort across disciplines/institutional sectors.

- Brings community planning & discussions from the beginning.

© L.R. Sandmann, 2010
What Counts?
Unpacking...

- Service
  - Professional
  - University
  - Community
- Scholarship
“While engaged scholarship is situated in the “swamp,” one can take a scholarly approach to the swamp and not get buried in it!”

Cheryl Rosaen
Professor, Teacher Education
Michigan State University

© L.R. Sandmann, 2010
“We’re doing something unique, and we don’t want to document it in a traditional way. My engagement activities are not meant to be a substitute for traditional research scholarship. They represent a new paradigm.”

Warren Rauhe
Professor, Landscape Architecture
Michigan State University

© L.R. Sandmann, 2010
ARCHITECTURE OF ENGAGED SCHOLARSHIP:
SAME QUESTIONS, DIFFERENT ANSWERS

- Purpose
- Questions
- Research Design
- Data Analysis
- Dissemination

© L.R. Sandmann, 2010
Quality—Evaluation
Criteria

- Goals/questions
- Context of theory, literature, best practices
- Methods
- Results
- Communication/dissemination
- Reflective critique

National Review Board Scholarship of Engagement (2001)

© L.R. Sandmann, 2010
Continuous Collaboration with External Partner

Continuous Reflection Feedback, and Adaptation

PURPOSE  PROCESS  OUTCOMES
PROCESS
Design & Delivery

Attainable Goals

Appropriate Method

Continuous Reflection

Ongoing Adaptation

© L.R. Sandmann, 2010
Degree of Collaborative Processes in Engaged Scholarship

High Degree - Determined mutually

- Research Questions
- Research Design
- Data Gathering
- Data Analysis
- Application of Findings

Low Degree - Determined unilaterally by one partner


© L.R. Sandmann, 2010
Outcomes of Engaged Scholarship

COMMUNITY IMPACT

ALTERED COMMUNITY, PRACTICE, AND/OR PUBLIC POLICY CHANGE, ETC.

HIGH
ACADEMIC IMPACT

LOW/INDIRECT
COMMUNITY IMPACT

LOW
ACADEMIC IMPACT

HIGH/INDIRECT
COMMUNITY IMPACT

LOW
ACADEMIC IMPACT

LOW/INDIRECT
COMMUNITY IMPACT

HIGH
ACADEMIC IMPACT

NEW TIMES/NEW SCHOLARSHIP (2007)

© L.R. Sandmann, 2010
Case in Point!
YOUR EFFORT—TWO QUESTIONS

Is it Engagement?  Is it Scholarship?
Assessment of Engaged Scholarship Proposal

- Is this an engaged effort? Is it scholarly? To what extent does this case project have the potential to be a “quality” scholarly engagement effort?
  - Use the NRB Evaluation Criteria

- What would you propose to enhance its quality—making it more engaged and more scholarly?

- How would you document this as scholarly engagement?

© L.R. Sandmann, 2010
Competencies in Engaged Scholarship

- Value and understand legitimacy and significant of ES concepts; experience in research
- Basic knowledge of
  - Definitions, scholarship products, outcomes and measures of quality

Novice  Intermediate  Advanced

© L.R. Sandmann, 2010
Competencies in Engaged Scholarship

1. Understanding of the concepts of community engagement and community-engaged scholarship (CES), and familiarity with basic literature and history of CES

2. Understanding of social determinants of health (economic, social, behavioral, political, environmental); developing skills and commitment for fostering community and social change.

3. Knowledge of and skills in applying the principles of CES in theory and practice, including:
   - Principles
   - Theoretical frameworks
   - Models and methods of planning
   - Implementation and evaluation

4. Ability to work effectively in and with diverse communities.

5. Ability to negotiate across community-academic groups.

6. Ability to write grants expressing CES principles and approaches.

7. Ability to write articles based on CES processes and outcomes for peer-reviewed publications.

© L.R. Sandmann, 2010
Competencies in Engaged Scholarship

8. Ability to transfer skills to the community, thereby enhancing community capacity, and ability to share skills with other faculty. Recognition by the community.

9. Knowledge and successful application of definition of CES, CES benchmarks, scholarly products, outcomes, and measures of quality.

10. Understanding of the policy implications of CES and ability to work with communities in translating the process and findings of CES into policy.

11. Ability to balance tasks in academia (e.g., research, teaching, service) posing special challenges to those engaged in CES in order to thrive in an academic environment.

12. Ability to effectively describe the scholarly components of the work in a portfolio for review, promotion and/or tenure.

13. Knowledge of RPT process and its relationship with CES, ability to serve on RPT committee.

14. Ability to mentor student and junior faculty in establishing and building CES-based portfolio.

Blanchard, et al. (2009) Metropolitan Universities

© L.R. Sandmann, 2010
UNH’s Niche...

Federal Priorities/ Funding
+
Engaged Scholarship
Homework Assignment...

- Interview an experienced engaged scholar about establishing and working with an external partner.

- Do readings on scholarly engagement included in your notebook/online.
Lorilee R. Sandmann

The University of Georgia
Lifelong Ed., Admin., & Policy
413 River’s Crossing Bldg.
Athens, GA 30602
706.542.4014
sandmann@uga.edu

© L.R. Sandmann, 2010